

arquideas

JURY DECISION INTERNATIONAL COMPETITION | MUSEUM OF THE ANCIENT NILE (MoAN) EGYPT

The Jury

- **Xander Vermeulen** | Principal of XVW architectuur
- **Silvia Perea** | Curator of art and architecture
- **Pilar Calderón** | Architect, Co-founder of Calderon-Folch Studio
- **Marisa Santamaría** | Head of Institutional Relations and Special Projects of IED Madrid
- **Ione Ruete** | Manager of Barcelona Building Construmat
- **Andrés González-Meneses** | Winner of CaVA Arizona architecture competition

Jury Decision

The Jury members of the Museum of the Ancient Nile (MoAN) Egypt architecture competition, having carefully considered all the 264 submitted proposals from 44 countries, made their evaluation in two stages in order to unify opinions and finding a fair verdict.

The Jury, considering the evaluation criteria specified in the Terms and Conditions, such as how clearly the ideas of the project are transmitted, the quality of the architectural proposal, the settlement criteria, as well as the dialogue between the proposal and the landscape, the solutions provided for the proposed program of uses, and the criteria of sustainability and energy efficiency, after the first phase of evaluation, highlights 15 proposals as finalists.

In a second evaluation phase, the Jury selected 5 honourable mentions and the 3 winning proposals.

As a group, these proposals represent the values the contest was trying to transmit, providing thoughtful and talented approaches to the set problem.



FINALISTS

MoAN 1020

Santiago Marulanda López
Efraín Cárdenas Osorio
*Universidad Nacional de Colombia – Sede
Manizales, Colombia*

MoAN 1088

Paola Mattioli
Luigi Filippo Santilli
Andrea Polzonetti
Politecnico di Milano, Italy

MoAN 1232

Jesús Montejano
*Escuela Técnica Superior de Arquitectura de
Valencia, Spain*

MoAN 1561

Indibil Solans Ibañez
Lara Arin Gonzalez
Lluís Balcells Gracia
Universitat Rovira i Virgili, Spain

MoAN 1676

Francisco Javier Fernández García
Carlos Montes González
*Escuela Técnica Superior de Arquitectura de
Sevilla, Spain*

MoAN 1685

Sebastian Villamil Pociña
Camilo Alvarez
*Facultad de Arquitectura y Diseño de Uruguay,
Uruguay*

MoAN 1700

Manuel Berke
Belén Dalmaso
*Facultad de Arquitectura y Diseño de Uruguay,
Uruguay*

HONOURABLE MENTIONS

MoAN 1122

Sandra Milena Jaramillo Hernandez
Daniel Felipe Osorio Ciro
Universidad San Buenaventura, Colombia

The jury members values the respect to the environment, not invasive structure, the sense and sensitivity and it capability of arousing feelings before one even begins to rationalize it. It is a river under the river, close to roots. An immersive experience and emotional impact that tells a story of collective cultural legacy.

Beautiful proposal that shows the important cycle of high and low tides on the Nile, a cycle that drove the agricultural development along the Nile and lay at the base of the ancient culture.

This proposal introduces a museum hidden from the human's sight while he is in a ground level. In terms of concept, the museum seems to invite an amount of water inside of it, with the intention of keeping it there as a precious part of the present exhibition. Its delicacy at the time of its placement in the landscape contrasts with the intensity of discovering its interior space, quite permeable and changing according to the position and light of the Sun throughout the day and the seasons. In terms of design, the spaces are mysterious ones, monumental having a big impact in the experience of each visitor.

The idea of this proposal is clearly expressed and is as provocative as inspiring. Nevertheless, the jury would recommend the authors to take into account the relevance of accessibility and logistical complexity as well as the security of visitors and collections from predictable perils. Immersing the museum in the heart of the Nile would entail a degree of operational complexity for the institution and would present so many unnecessary risks that the idea would be at the brink of utopia.

MoAN 1282

Juan Lobera Martin
Juan Muñoz Núñez
Luis Valdemoro Arribas
Escuela Técnica Superior de Arquitectura de Madrid, Spain

Clear and strong contemporary architectural gesture. The jury highlights the great presentation and value the symbolic simplicity, the new minimalism and the materials way of thinking.

The project adopts the serenity of the ancient Egyptian temples, posing a resounding horizontal volume of serene proportions at the edge of the Nile. Its materiality and language evokes the place and makes the proposed architecture transcend beyond its physical volumetry.

Although the presentation of this proposal is not that clear, the schematic hand-made model seems to describe mainly the intentions of design and not the actual design of the museum. In terms of design, the big façade in the waterfront, with the large opening, creates a nice entrance to the museum, which seems to be self-contained, to keep the exhibition and the visitors inside of it.

This is an essential yet powerful proposal which creates a relevant space above the river. All in all, the jury wonder how the museum's program benefits from this gesture. How does the program enhance it/justifies it? A bit more of development would have certainly helped in better understanding the idea's full potential.

MoAN 1385

Amir Haghshenas
Mehrad Alimohammadi
Milad Salehivasegh
Islamic Azad University of Tehran, Iran

The jury members value the intelligent internal circulation. The project is committed to linear travel and adapts its language to landscape horizontality, positioning itself on the river bank and establishing a resounding axis parallel to it. Through the linear concatenation of spaces the visitor discovers the program and the different museum activities, evoking with this linearity the grandeur and immense length of the Nile River. The cover of these spaces becomes a great open viewpoint to landscape, offering possibilities of Parallel tours of great interest.

Keeping the building linear, the proposal creates a constant view of visitors to the river. It seems to create a new land, full of spaces, close to the water, that gives a different character in the river waterfront region.

The simplicity, the unique voice, the functionality and the internal interactivity are the strong points of the project. Unfortunately, the jury believes that the proposal does not take advantage enough of the potentially exciting position on the edge between water and land. It is a visually arresting proposal, yet it poses conceptual, scale and circulation problems.

MoAN 1582

Erlly Aquise
Estefania Cristina Estofanero Flores
Victor Del Carpio Torres
Jose Paredes
Universidad Nacional de San Agustín de Arequipa, Peru

The jury highlights the exceptional response to the place, generating two very different but inseparable areas - interior and exterior - while offering a transition of great interest among them. Landscape, place, vegetation and river come together in a concatenation of spaces full of surprises through a clear axis perpendicular to the river that reinforces the roundness of the proposal.

The proposal introduces a long grid that organizes everything and works both as a structure and as a monument, giving a strong presence to the museum in the environment of the river.

The monumentality and the formal simplicity of the intervention, is achieved with a simple strategy: the repetition of the same piece that interweaves with nature and connects the desert with the Nile. This dialogue of the intervention with the environment allows the experience of the visitor to be a communion with nature.

The monumentality of the columns along their linear route, standing out in the landscape and generating an attractive visual landmark from the outside, evokes the grandiosity of the columns of the ancient Egyptian temples while generating an atmosphere of transcendence.

Interesting and potentially very exciting structure with a visual impact that is close to land art. However, the route through and underneath the structure does not feel fitting to this concept. On the other hand, the project's image is powerful and evocative, but the jury doubts if it would perhaps be more appropriate to use an existing ruin rather than imitating the ruin's concept in a new construction.

MoAN 1704

Pablo Laguna Salamanca
Antonio Merino Márquez
Universidad de Granada, Spain

This proposal is a story telling of a journey through history of centuries of the river Nile. The concept of it and the presentation are in sync, and this is very important. It is based on a cartographical analysis, and keeps itself emblematic.

The jury highlights the very attractive and brave contrast between the ancient world and modern architecture, adapting the solidity and volumetric rotundity of the Egyptian temples to the modern language and placing itself following the axis of the Abu Simbel temple, thus causing a strong link between both pieces. Thanks to this integration, both formal and material, a reconciliation between the existing and the new piece is achieved. The roundness of the forms favors the game between lights and shadows, proposing a new point of view that at that at the same time serves as access to the museum. The monumentality, materiality and language of the proposal help to understand the transcendence of the place and its history.

The project is the result of a synergic strategy. By placing itself at the feet of the Egyptian temple, it benefits from its visitors and provides the temple, in return, extra interpretive space. Drawback: it only addresses one 'layer' of the history of the Nile.

WINNERS

1ST Prize: MoAN 1117

Diego Botella Olaizola
Álvaro Jiménez Zúñiga
Omar Páez Albitre
Yacme Mangrané Sierra
Escuela de Ingeniería y Arquitectura de la Universidad de Zaragoza, Spain

The jury awards the concept of this approach. A small-scale, floating, ephemeral and mobile museum that introduces the importance of exploration and observation for a powerful relation between visitors and the atmosphere and history of this land.

The 'content' of this museum unfolds during a journey along the Nile. The landscape becomes the exposition. It explores the space through a circuit of lighthouses as meeting points that are discovered as the river is navigated and that have a minimal visual impact. This offers the possibility of surprise through a indefinite travel open to multiple variations.

An architectural craftsmanship with artistic view without material limits. An original point of view where architecture dematerializes, transcends and becomes landscape. A museum for a river such as Nile, should not be a static structure with strict boundaries but an artifact that suggest an open interpretation of the context and an immersive experience to the history through the contemporaneity.

Radically poetic, sensitive and delicate proposal, which opens an interesting debate about the role of museums. This idea embodies the paradigm shift that the museum field has been experiencing for the last decades, and which consists on the transformation of a collection-based museum into a public-based forum.

The jury would like to praise the capacity of this traveling museum to connect with different communities and speak to them all about their common past, thus complying with the civic role that museums in the 21st century are expected to assume.

2ND Prize: MoAN 1260

Najda Djuhara
Rama Dwiwahyu
Dennis Cahya Indra
Ahmad Zabel Fachreza
Parahyangan Catholic University, Indonesia

The jury awards the symbolic approach of this proposal. Elegant and convincing contemporary architectural gesture that binds the Nile and the desert landscape through which it flows together. Within it the exposition has a self-evident place.

The most interesting part is the circular elevated pathway (which in terms of symbolism, represents the circle of life and death of the sun and the river) in the masterplan. The formal clarity of the proposal and the sensitivity with which it manages to rest on the ground, without disturbing, gives the piece a sculptural and symbolic character. With this simple intervention, it manages to put in value the nature, proposing a new point of view from which the visitor enjoy the wonderful landscape, which takes on a new meaning.

The fact that the built environment moves from human scale to a gigantic one and reverse, is the actual beauty of this proposal, which manages to have different scales and parts of design, creating a variety of qualities of space.

It seems to organize perfectly the built environment and the rest of the regions inside it while it, at the same time, gives visitors and inhabitants the opportunity to observe the outer environment while walking and experiencing different qualities of space, sound and light.

The jury appreciates in this proposal a poetic futuristic rebirth, a new architectural existentialism and the advanced and innovative materials. The proposal also adopts a radical position when implanted in the place, generating a milestone or point of attraction in the visible landscape from a great distance. This great impact on the surrounding landscape and the idea of surveilling a historic settlement from above, rather than providing a direct contact with its intricate urbanism and public life, makes the jury doubt about the appropriation for a museum aimed to publicly celebrate a civilization's past.

3RD Prize: MoAN 1066

Daniel Carvalho

Faculdade de Arquitectura da Universidade do Porto, Portugal

Bold and monumental structure that presents itself in the landscape with a similar architectural clarity as the ancient structures do. The 'light' wooden and textile structure refers to the (historic) everyday life along the Nile, instead of the monuments. The use of the fabric is a clever, contemporary way to offer a comfortable climate within the building and on the viewing and event decks.

One of a kind, the jury values the open spaces in a constant movement, the sustainability, the graceful sense of lightness and newness, and the innovation by mixing materials. It has a distinctive individual voice rather than a concrete style, not invasive structure over water, and is an exercise of research and implementation. It embrace risks and it achieves a shape that is a structure of experimentation.

This proposal introduces a museum with an extended program of uses, giving a different character to the entire region of interest. The building is nicely organized by a structural grid, and regardless its size, it manages to be flowing.

It's like it is floating in the water, giving a feeling of lightness despite its large dimensions. Due to the high level of transparency and visual permeability it offers an interesting relationship between inside and

outside, creating multiple views framed around its perimeter. The possibility of calibrating the amount of enclosure towards the exterior results in different spatial combinations of great interest for the museum.

The proposal is appealing from the conceptual and architectural point of view. However, there's a certain insistence on the building's regularity that may pose problems when developing a museum's new program and circulation. It would be better understood if it were a renovation of an old, industrial warehouse where a program would have to be fit, rather than a new building deriving from the conception of a new program.

Acknowledgments

Arquideas would like to thank all the participants for their effort and dedication in this contest and congratulate them for the quality of the proposals presented.

Arquideas would also like to thank the members of the Jury of this contest for their cooperation and dedication and the collaborating businesses El Croquis, Plataforma Arquitectura, AV Proyectos, WA Wettbewerbe Aktuell and The AAAA Magazine for their involvement in the contest.



The Arquideas Team

